On Palestinian Apartheid

Submission of United Nations Watch to the United Nations Commission of Inquiry on the Occupied Palestinian Territory, including East Jerusalem, and Israel

Submitted By:

Dina Rovner
Legal Advisor
United Nations Watch
Case Postale 191
1211 Geneva 20, Switzerland
Tel: +41 22 734 1472

28 February 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTROD	DUCTION	1
I.	PALESTINIAN APARTHEID AND RACIAL SEGREGATION	
	1. PLO and Fatah Charters	4
	2. Hamas Charter	5
	B. Palestinian Authority law prohibits land sales to Jewish Israelis	6
	C. Palestinian Authority law promotes and rewards terrorism against Jewish	
II.	ANTISEMITIC INCITEMENT BY PALESTINIAN OFFICIALS	10
	A. Incitement by Palestinian Authority President Mahmoud Abbas	11
	B. Incitement by other Palestinian Authority officials	12
	C. Incitement by Hamas officials	14
III.	ANTISEMITIC INCITEMENT IN PALESTINIAN MEDIA AND EDUCAT	ION15
	A. Incitement Against Jews and Israelis in Palestinian Media	15
	1. Examples of classic antisemitism	16
	2. Examples of demonizing Israelis and Jews	17
	3. Examples of denying Jewish rights in Israel	18
	4. Examples of inciting and glorifying terrorism	19
	B. Incitement Against Jews and Israelis in Palestinian Education	20
	1. Palestinian Authority educators promote hatred and violence	21
	2. School curriculum indoctrinates children to hatred and violence	21
	3. Turning terrorists who murdered Jews into role models for children	23
	4. Exploiting educational activities to train children in terrorism	24
IV.	PALESTINIAN RACISM AND DISCRMINATION	26
	A. Palestinian Authority fails to protect Israelis from violence	27
	B. Palestinian Authority denies Jews the right to own property	28
	C. Palestinian racism against Afro-Palestinians	28
	D. Palestinian Violations of Freedom of Religion	29
	Palestinian violations against Jews	29
	2. Palestinian failure to ensure freedom of religion for Christians	31
	3. Palestinian persecution of Samaritans	33
CONCL	USION	34

INTRODUCTION

This submission is made without prejudice to our request, dated 14 February 2022, for Ms. Navi Pillay to recuse herself as Chair of this Commission of Inquiry on the grounds of bias, including her recent lobbying of governments to sanction Israel for alleged crimes that are the very object of this investigation.¹

At the conclusion of its 30th Special Session on 27 May 2021, the Human Rights Council adopted resolution A/HRC/RES/S-30/1, creating this Commission of Inquiry ("COI"). Under a very broad mandate, the COI is tasked to "investigate in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, and Israel. . .all underlying root causes of recurrent tensions. . . including systemic discrimination and repression based on national, ethnic, racial or religious identity."

The history of the COI makes clear that it was created to target alleged Israeli violations. Nevertheless, if this is meant to be a serious investigation, it must examine the Palestinians' own record when it comes to "systemic discrimination and repression based on national, ethnic, racial or religious identity."

Accordingly, United Nations Watch makes this submission for the purpose of providing the COI with critical facts and legal analysis concerning systemic discrimination by the Palestinian Authority ("PA") and Hamas—the entity in control of the Gaza Strip—against Israeli Jews and Jews in general, based on their national, ethnic, racial or religious identity.

This report details multiple examples of systemic racism by the PA and Hamas which violate various international treaties ratified by the Palestinians, including the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination ("ICERD") (Articles 3, 4, 5, 7), the Convention on the Rights of the Child ("CRC") (Articles 3, 6, 14, 17, 19, 29), the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights ("ICCPR") (Articles 1, 2, 6, 12, 18, 20, 26) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ("ICESCR") (Articles 1, 2, 13).

The PA and Hamas routinely violate these treaty provisions through laws, policies, and statements aimed at denying any Jewish rights in Israel or the Palestinian-controlled territories; and inundating Palestinian society, including children, through the education system and the media with messages of hate and violence, which encourage the killing of Israelis and glorify martyrdom in the struggle to liberate all of Israel (from the Jordan River to the Mediterranean Sea) for the State of Palestine. Thus, instead of preventing racial incitement against Jews and Israelis, Palestinian leaders actively promulgate such incitement with impunity.

Systematic Palestinian incitement to murder Israeli Jews because of their identity has the danger of leading to atrocity crimes. "Atrocity crimes," in the words of UN Secretary-General

¹ Request for Navi Pillay to Recuse Herself for Bias or the Appearance Thereof, UN WATCH (February 14, 2022), https://unwatch.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/Request-for-Navi-Pillay-to-Recuse-Herself-on-Grounds-of-Bias.pdf.

Antonio Guterres, "do not generally happen suddenly or spontaneously. The processes leading to them take time to unfold." One of the most common of these signs, noted Mr. Guterres, is "the dissemination of hate speech—messages in public discourse and the media, including social media, which spread hostility and encourage people to commit violence against specific communities, often based on their identity."²

It is emphasized that the antisemitic incitement is carried over into laws, policies and actions. For example, Palestinian land laws prohibit the sale of land to Israeli Jews, and Israeli law prohibits Israelis from entering the territories controlled by the PA and Hamas for safety reasons—Israelis that enter these territories risk being physically attacked and even killed. Even worse, Palestinian law incentivizes the murder of Israeli Jews by providing financial rewards to Palestinian terrorists who kill or attempt to kill Israeli Jews. Significantly, although Israel has a thriving Arab minority that actively participates in and contributes to Israeli society, there are no Jews in the Palestinian-controlled territories and it is dangerous for Jews, particularly Israeli Jews, even to travel there.

Recently, two UN treaty bodies reviewing the Palestinian compliance with international human rights treaties criticized Palestinian racism against Israelis and Jews. In February 2020, the UN committee charged with reviewing state compliance with the Child Rights Convention expressed concern about "reports that the contents of some textbooks do not promote peace and tolerance" and urged the Palestinians to ensure that the curriculum is "aligned with the aims of education as included in Article 29 of the Convention," particularly "to promote peace and tolerance." ³

In August 2019, CERD, the UN committee charged with reviewing state compliance with the Anti-Racism Convention, found that Palestinians laws and policies failed to implement UN treaties on racism, or to properly investigate complaints for acts of racial discrimination. The panel urged Ramallah to combat "hate speech and incitement to violence," saying it was "concerned" about statements by Palestinian public figures, politicians and media officials, as well as in school textbooks and curricula, pointing to "hate speech against Israelis" which it found "fuels hatred" and "may incite violence" and "antisemitism." The Committee further called on the Palestinians to "remove any derogatory comments and images from school curricula and textbooks that perpetuate prejudices and hatred."

During the review, several members of CERD pressed the Palestinian delegation on antisemitism and incitement against Israelis. For example:

• CERD member Silvio José Albuquerque e Silva of Brazil noted that the Committee had received, "disturbing information about the presence of antisemitism and discriminatory

² Plan of Action for Religious Leaders and Actors to Prevent Incitement to Violence that Could Lead to Atrocity Crimes, UN Office of Genocide Prevention (July 2017), http://www.un.org/en/genocideprevention/documents/publications-and-resources/Plan%20of%20Action_Religious-rev4.pdf

 $^{^3}$ Concluding observations on the initial report of the State of Palestine, UN Doc. CRC/C/PSE/CO/1, ¶¶ 54(e) and 55(e) (February 10, 2020).

⁴ Concluding observations on the combined initial and second periodic reports of the State of Palestine, UN Doc. CERD/C/PSE/CO/1-2, ¶¶ 19 and 20 (August 29, 2019).

contents in textbooks used by children and teenagers in Palestinian schools" and asked the Palestinian delegation to "provide concrete and factual examples of recent reviews in textbooks eliminating direct or indirect reference to Antisemitism and racial discrimination."

- CERD member Chinsung Chung of South Korea referred to NGO reports about "antisemitic and anti-Israeli prejudices and incitement to hatred and violence against Israeli and Jewish communities in Palestine..." and asked the Palestinian delegation about its "strategies... to raise awareness on the negative effect of racial discrimination and the need for tolerance and understanding among different groups in order to combat racial stereotypes and prejudices."
- CERD member Verene Albertha Shepherd of Jamaica pressed the Palestinian delegation on "how the content of the curriculum and the textbooks used at the lower levels in particular, especially history textbooks are geared towards teaching non-discrimination, respect and tolerance and human rights for all?" in light of NGO reports that "the education system does not conform to UN standards."
- CERD member Bakari Sidiki Diaby of Ivory Coast questioned the Palestinian delegation about hate speech in the media, "Could you tell us in public media, how are the minorities represented? Is there a Jewish minority in Palestine? And how is the Jewish community represented in media online and other media?"
- **CERD member Marc Bossuyt of Belgium** remarked that "some of the activities [by Palestinians] that are against the Occupation...are also contrary to the Geneva Conventions and other international human rights conventions," and asked "What is the action of the Palestinian Authorities to these activities when these activities run counter to international standards, or do the authorities consider that any anti-occupying activity can be justified given that it is driven by the determination to protest against the occupation of Palestinian territories?"

United Nations Watch urges this COI to follow the leadership of these UN treaty bodies and to investigate and report on systemic PA and Hamas incitement and discrimination against Jews and Israelis.

I. PALESTINIAN APARTHEID AND RACIAL SEGREGATION

Article 3 of ICERD obligates state parties to "undertake to prevent, prohibit and eradicate all practices" of "racial segregation and apartheid." As explained in the Committee's guidelines for state party reports, the reference to apartheid refers to "all forms of racial segregation." Racial segregation, more specifically the ethnic cleansing of Jews, has been the policy in the West Bank

3

⁵ Guidelines for the CERD-Specific Document to be Submitted by State Parties Under Article 9, Paragraph 1, of the Convention, UN Doc. CERD/C/2007/1 (June 13, 2008).

at least since Jordan took control in 1948 when it massacred or forcibly expelled any remaining Jewish residents and destroyed Jewish synagogues, cemeteries and schools.⁶

At the end of the 1948 war for Israel's independence no Jews were left in the West Bank. The West Bank, including East Jerusalem and the Jewish Quarter of the Old City, remained free of Jews for the next 19 years until Israel defeated Jordan in the Six Day War, after which Jews returned to lands Jews had purchased there prior to Israel's independence. At the same time that Jordan ensured the West Bank was free of Jews, those Arabs who remained in Israeli territory following the 1948 war gained Israeli citizenship and became part of Israeli society. Today, there are many prominent Israeli Arab figures, including doctors, lawyers, judges, politicians and media personalities in Israel. However, there is no Jewish community in the Palestinian-controlled territories.

Moreover, the vision for any future Palestinian state is one of a state that is completely free of Jews (*judenrein*). This is clearly set out in the foundational documents of the main Palestinian nationalist movements, specifically, The Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO), its dominant Fatah faction, and Hamas. Those documents reject Israel's right to exist in any part of Palestine and view Jews and Zionism as the enemy. This Palestinian rejection of the rights of Jews to any part of the territory continues today, as it has been enshrined in Palestinian legislation prohibiting land sales to Jews and rewarding Palestinian terrorists for murdering Jews, and is reflected in statements by Palestinian officials, in the media and in the education system.

A. Palestinian Charters Reject Israel's Right to Exist

1. PLO and Fatah Charters

The Palestinian National Charter⁸ (PLO Charter) describes Palestine as "the homeland of the Arab Palestinian people" (Article 1), calls for its "liberation" through "armed struggle" (Articles 8-9), and defines Palestine according to its boundaries during the British Mandate (Article 2), which include the entire State of Israel. Furthermore, the "liberation of Palestine" is described as "a national duty" and "aims at the elimination of Zionism in Palestine." Although Yasser Arafat promised, as part of the Oslo Accords, that the PLO Charter would be amended to remove all provisions calling for the destruction of the State of Israel, that change never occurred.⁹

⁶ Alan Dershowitz, *Kerry's Speech Will Make Peace Harder*, ALGEMEINER (December 29, 2016), https://www.algemeiner.com/2016/12/29/alan-dershowitz-kerrys-speech-will-makes-peace-harder/.

⁷ Eugene Kontorovich, *A Palestinian State Free of Jews?* TABLET (September 15, 2016), https://www.tabletmag.com/scroll/213597/a-palestinian-state-free-of-jews; Eugene Kontorovich, *Airbnb's Anti-Israel Hypocrisy*, WALL STREET JOURNAL (November 25, 2018), https://en.kohelet.org.il/publication/airbnbs-anti-israel-hypocrisy.

⁸ The Palestinian National Charter: Resolutions of the Palestine National Council July 1-17, 1968, THE AVALON PROJECT (Last visited July 1, 2019), http://avalon.law.yale.edu/20th century/plocov.asp

⁹ Andrew C. McCarthy, *The Father of Modern Terrorism; The True Legacy of Yasser Arafat*, NATIONAL REVIEW (November 12, 2004), https://www.nationalreview.com/2004/11/father-modern-terrorism-andrew-c-mccarthy/; Julie Stahl, *One Year Later, New PLO Covenant Nowhere to Be Found*, CNS NEWS (July 7, 2008), https://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, https://www.nationalreview.com/2004/11/father-modern-terrorism-andrew-c-mccarthy/; Julie Stahl, *One Year Later, New PLO Covenant Nowhere to Be Found*, CNS NEWS (July 7, 2008), https://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, https://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, https://www.cnsnews.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, https://www.nationalreview.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, https://www.nationalreview.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be-found; Dr. Mordechai Kedar, <a href="https://www.nationalreview.com/news/article/one-year-later-new-plo-covenant-nowhere-be

Instead, the Charter continues to absolutely reject the national rights of Jews in Palestine, stating that only Jews who resided in Palestine "until the beginning of the Zionist invasion will be considered Palestinians" (Article 6). Although there is no date given here, the first Jewish migration to Palestine under the auspices of Zionism, known as "The First Aliya," occurred in 1882. ¹⁰ In this regard, the Charter adds that Jews are "citizens of the states to which they belong" (Article 20). Thus, the PLO Charter denies outright the rights of most Israeli Jews to live in the territory it defines as Palestine. Furthermore, the PLO Charter extends its rejection of Jewish rights in Palestine to the Balfour Declaration, which is viewed "as null and void" (Article 20) and to the UN partition plan which is considered "illegal" (Article 19).

Moreover, the charter of the PLO's largest faction—Fatah—headed by PA President Mahmoud Abbas—contains similar language. The Fatah Charter, which was amended in 2009, states that "Palestine is part of the Arab World," (Article 1), "Israeli existence in Palestine" is "a Zionist invasion" (Chapter 1, Article 8), and Palestine must be liberated through "armed public revolution" (Chapter 1, Article 17). As referenced in the Charter, Palestine includes the territory of the State of Israel. Indeed, the goal of the struggle is "uprooting the Zionist existence" and "this struggle will not cease unless the Zionist state is demolished and Palestine is completely liberated" (Chapter 1, Article 19).¹¹

PA institutions and officials continue to call for the liberation of Palestine and to reject Israel's right to exist as a Jewish state, as detailed in Section II below. In July 2016, PA President Mahmoud Abbas confirmed that he would never recognize Israel as a Jewish state: "it is impossible that I will accept [the demand to recognize Israel as a Jewish state]. Let [Israel] continue to talk about a Jewish state and we will soundly reject it." 12

2. Hamas Charter

Hamas is the governing authority in the Gaza Strip. The 1988 Hamas Charter¹³ proclaims that "the land of Palestine is an Islamic Waqf consecrated for future Muslim generations until Judgment Day" (Article 11); and "there is no solution for the Palestinian question except through Jihad" (Article 13). Jihad is described in military terms, to "confront the enemies and join the ranks of the fighters" (Article 15) and is primarily understood to involve "carrying of arms" and "confrontation of the enemy" (Article 30). The enemies here are the Jews and Zionists: "in the face of the Jews' usurpation of Palestine, it is compulsory that the banner of Jihad be raised" (Article 15); "the Zionist invasion is a vicious invasion" (Article 28).

¹⁰ Immigration to Israel: The First Aliya (1882-1903), JEWISH VIRTUAL LIBRARY (last visited June 10, 2019), https://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/the-first-aliyah-1882-1903.

¹¹ Fatah Charter, PMW from FATAH WEBSITE (July 1, 2009),

http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=640&doc_id=1160; C. Jacob, Fatah Sixth General Conference Resolutions: Pursuing Peace Option Without Relinquishing Resistance or Right to Armed Struggle, MEMRI (August 31, 2009), https://www.memri.org/reports/fatah-sixth-general-conference-resolutions-pursuing-peace-option-without-relinquishing.

¹² Abbas: I will never recognize Israel as a Jewish State, PMW (July 27, 2016), https://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=820&doc_id=19012.

¹³ Hamas Covenant 1988, THE AVALON PROJECT (last visited July 1, 2019), http://avalon.law.yale.edu/20th_century/hamas.asp.

The Charter is overtly antisemitic, comparing Jews to Nazis (Article 20), promoting conspiracy theories about Jewish power, such as that the Jews were behind World Wars I and II, "there is no war going on anywhere, without having their [the Jews] finger in it" (Article 22), and accusing the Zionists of trying to take over the world (Article 32).

In May 2017, Hamas released a new policy document which some said was a sign of moderation. However, the new document does not replace the charter and continues to view Israel as an enemy that needs to be eliminated.¹⁴ The new document states that the goal of Hamas is to "liberate Palestine and confront the Zionist project" and that "Hamas rejects any alternative to the full and complete liberation of Palestine, from the [Jordan] river to the [Mediterranean] sea" (*i.e.*, including all of the territory of the State of Israel). The document also calls the establishment of Israel "entirely illegal," and states "there shall be no recognition of the legitimacy of the Zionist entity."

B. Palestinian Authority law prohibits land sales to Jewish Israelis

Palestinian rejection of Jewish rights in Palestine is not limited to the aforementioned charters, but is manifest today in Palestinian legislation, including in PA land laws. In December 2018, the case of American-Palestinian Isaam Akel made headlines when he was sentenced to life in prison with hard labor for violating the Palestinian law prohibiting land sales to Israelis. He was tried for attempting to sell property located in the Muslim Quarter of the Old City of Jerusalem to a Jewish Israeli organization. The Palestinian Grand Criminal Court convicted Akel of "attempting to cut off a part of the Palestinian land and adding them to a foreign country." ¹⁵

Akel's conviction was part of a PA crackdown on land sales to Jews. One week before the conviction, the PA announced the arrest of 44 Palestinians for involvement in attempted sales of properties in the West Bank and East Jerusalem to Jewish Israelis. Two months earlier, in November 2018, two Palestinians were sentenced to 15 years of hard labor for selling land to Israeli Jews. The part of the PA crackdown on land sales to Jews. One week before the conviction, the PA announced the arrest of 44 Palestinians for involvement in attempted sales of properties in the West Bank and East Jerusalem to Jewish Israelis. Two months earlier, in November 2018, two Palestinians were sentenced to 15 years of hard labor for selling land to Israeli Jews.

Palestinian persecution of those attempting to sell land to Jews did not end with the case of Issam Akel. In October 2021, a Palestinian court sentenced a Palestinian to 15 years in prison

¹⁴ Kate Havard, Hamas's New Document: More of the Same, FOUNDATION FOR DEFENSE OF DEMOCRACIES (May 2, 2017), https://www.fdd.org/analysis/2017/05/02/hamass-new-document-more-of-the-same/; Adam Rasgon, https://www.fdd.org/analysis/2017/05/02/hamass-new-document-more-of-the-same/; Adam Rasgon, https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/Analysis-No-moderation-here-489581.

¹⁵ Palestinian court jails U.S.-Palestinian for life for Jerusalem land sale, REUTERS (December 31, 2018), https://www.reuters.com/article/us-israel-palestinians-usa-detainee/palestinian-court-jails-u-s-palestinian-for-life-for-jerusalem-land-sale-idUSKCN1OU0JG; Khaled Abu Toameh, *Palestinian-American Sentenced to Life in Prison by PA for Selling Property to Jews*, JERUSALEM POST (December 31, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/Palestinian-American-gets-life-in-prison-for-selling-properties-to-Jews-575903.

¹⁶ Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Arrests 44 Palestinians for Selling Properties to Jews*, JERUSALEM POST (December 23, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/PA-arrests-44-Palestinians-for-selling-properties-to-Jews-575221.

¹⁷ Adam Rasgon, *PA court sentences Palestinians to 15 years hard labor for selling land to Jews*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (November 21, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/pa-court-sentences-palestinians-to-15-years-hard-labor-for-selling-land-to-jews/.

for attempting to sell land to Israeli Jews. ¹⁸ It also is not a new phenomenon. In 2016, a group of Palestinian activists, operating with the blessing of senior PA and Hamas officials, undertook a campaign against Palestinians engaged in land sales to Jews. ¹⁹ In 2009, a Hebron court sentenced a Palestinian man to death by hanging for selling land near his village in the West Bank to Israelis. ²⁰ In 2010, another PA court ruled that selling, or attempting to sell land to a foreign country could result in the death penalty. ²¹ Prior to that, at least eight Palestinians suspected of involvement in the sales of property to Jews had been kidnapped and executed extrajudicially. ²²

The prohibition against selling land to Israeli Jews is based on PA laws and fatwas (Islamic religious decrees).²³ Article 114 of the Jordanian Penal Code, applicable to the Palestinian territories, prohibits Palestinians from selling lands to "an enemy state or one of its subjects."²⁴ Enemy state refers to Israel. In a 2014 executive order, PA President Mahmoud Abbas amended this section of the penal code to increase the penalty for this crime from temporary hard labor to hard labor for life.²⁵ However, courts have meted out the death sentence based on the PLO's Revolutionary Penal Code (1979) which applies the death penalty to traitors and those accused of "transferring positions to the enemy."²⁶

Palestinians consider it treason to sell land to Israeli Jews. In October 2018, amidst the crackdown, the Palestinian Fatwa Supreme Council issued a statement renewing the ban on property transactions with Israelis, emphasizing that "selling [property] to the occupation or facilitating the transfer of its ownership...is a great betrayal of the religion, the homeland, and morals." At around the same time, the PA daily *Al-Hayat Al-Jadida* reported that Abbas's Fatah faction emphasized that "sale of properties and lands to the occupation...constitutes high treason." Likewise, a recent study by the Palestinian Center for Policy and Survey Research found that nearly 90% of surveyed Palestinians would call Palestinians who sell land to Jews "traitors." 28

¹⁸ @KhaledAbuToameh, TWITTER (October 17, 2021, 6:12 PM), https://twitter.com/KhaledAbuToameh/status/1449755259753148422.

¹⁹ Id.

²⁰ Palestinian handed death sentence, BBC (April 29, 2009), http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/8024281.stm.

²¹ PA Court: Sale of Palestinian Land to Israelis Is Punishable by Death, HAARETZ (September 20, 2010), https://www.haaretz.com/1.5115464.

²² Khaled Abu Toameh, *Selling a House to a Jew is a betrayal of Allah*, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (June 20, 2016), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/8300/palestinians-homes-jews.

²⁴ Elhanan Miller, *Abbas toughens law against Palestinians selling land to Jews*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (October 21, 2014), https://www.timesofisrael.com/abbas-toughens-law-against-palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling Property to Israelis an Act of 'High Treason,'* JERUSALEM POST (October 12, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/PA-edict-Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling Property to Israelis an Act of 'High Treason,'* JERUSALEM POST (October 12, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/PA-edict-Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling Property to Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254*. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254*. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254*. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/; Khaled Abu Toameh, *Pa Edict: Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254*. https://www.palestinians-selling-land-to

²⁶ Elhanan Miller, *Abbas toughens law against Palestinians selling land to Jews*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (October 21, 2014), https://www.timesofisrael.com/abbas-toughens-law-against-palestinians-selling-land-to-jews/.

²⁷ Khaled Abu Toameh, *PA Edict: Selling Property to Israelis an Act of High Treason*, JERUSALEM POST (October 12, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/PA-edict-Selling-property-to-Israelis-an-act-of-high-treason-569254

²⁸ Maurice Hirsch, *The PA's Apartheid land laws*, PMW (December 31, 2018), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=27029.

To this day, Jewish Israelis cannot live in or even enter the territories controlled by the PA (areas A and B of the West Bank), which include a number of Jewish holy sites. Jews risk being physically assaulted or murdered if they enter these areas even by accident.²⁹ The Palestinian prohibition on the sale of land to Jews and the draconian penalties for violating this prohibition demonstrate that the PA intends to keep its territory *judenrein*. This amounts to apartheid and a blatant violation of Article 3 of ICERD.

C. Palestinian Authority law promotes and rewards terrorism against Jewish Israelis

The continuing Palestinian rejection of Jewish rights in Palestine is further manifest in the so-called "pay for slay" laws. Consistent with the PLO's declared goal of liberating Palestine and eradicating Zionism, Palestinian law actively encourages the murder of Jewish Israelis through its program of martyr and prisoner payments. The 2003 Amended Palestinian Basic Law guarantees the right of "martyrs, prisoners of war, the injured and the disabled," to "education, health and social insurance." A series of other laws from 2004 and 2013 mandate payments to these terrorists and/or their families with the amount of the payment determined according to the severity of the crime.

Each of these laws—Law No. 14 (2004), Amended Palestinian Prisoners Law No. 19 (2004), and Decree No. 1 (2013) on the Amendment of the Prisoners and Released Prisoners Law No. 19 (2004)—defines prisoner as "anyone incarcerated in the occupation's prisons for his participation in the struggle against the occupation," a reference to involvement in terror attacks against Israel. Furthermore, the law's description of the prisoners as "a fighting sector and an integral part of the fabric of the Arab Palestinian society," legitimizes their acts of terrorism and demonstrates their important position in Palestinian society. Significantly, these laws reward only terrorists who killed or injured Israelis or attempted to do so. Persons convicted of non-terrorist related crimes like theft do not receive similar rewards.

According to the law, the rewards to these terrorists include a monthly salary and other benefits, such as tuition fees at state universities and priority job placements at state institutions upon release from prison, with seniority determined based on the length of the prison term.³² Likewise, pursuant to PA Government Decision No. 23 of 2010, the amount of the monthly salary is fixed based on the length of the prison term.³³ Thus, the more serious the crime, the longer the prison sentence and the higher the salary.

²⁹ Id

³⁰ Article 22, 2003 Amended Palestinian Basic law (last visited June 3, 2019), https://www.palestinianbasiclaw.org/basic-law/2003-amended-basic-law.

³¹ Sander Gerber, *Incentivizing Terrorism: Palestinian Authority Allocations to Terrorists and their Families*, Appendix 5, JERUSALEM CENTER FOR PUBLIC AFFAIRS (2017), http://jcpa.org/paying-salaries-terrorists-contradicts-palestinian-vows-peaceful-intentions/#appendix-5; *PA Law No. 19*, BIRZEIT UNIVERSITY (last visited July 1, 2019), http://muqtafi.birzeit.edu/pg/getleg.asp?id=14777.

³² *Id*

³³ PA Government Decision No. 23, BIRZEIT UNIVERSITY (last visited July 1, 2019), http://muqtafi.birzeit.edu/pg/getleg.asp?id=16259.

Thousands of Palestinian prisoners currently serving or having served time in Israeli jails for terror-related offenses receive salaries and benefits from the PA.³⁴ Each year, the PA allocates approximately 7% of its budget to terrorist payments. The PA budget for 2018 allocated \$155 million (out of \$5 billion) to support for incarcerated or released terrorists. Another \$185 million was allocated to support the families of 24,000 "martyrs," *i.e.*, Palestinians killed while carrying out terrorist attacks or militant activities against Israel.³⁵

Despite a financial crisis in 2019 which led to cuts in the salaries of the PA's actual public employees, PA salaries to terrorists increased from 2018 to 2019.³⁶ In 2019, the PA paid \$150 million for prisoner salaries to incarcerated or released terrorists and \$194 million for martyrs.³⁷ In 2020, the PA paid more than \$181 million to incarcerated or released terrorists, not including martyrs payments.³⁸ Moreover, notwithstanding a new Israeli law threatening civil and criminal liability for banks that facilitate the transfers, the PA has continued the program by finding other ways to transfer funds to the beneficiaries.³⁹ These payments cannot be characterized as welfare as the payments are not based on need and the budget separately allocates more than \$200 million for welfare. Moreover, the PA has refused to transfer the salaries to its Ministry of Social Affairs. In January 2021, PA Ministry of Detainees and Ex-Detainees official Hassan Abd Rabbo admitted that the detainees are "fighters, not social cases."

The PA program of terror payments, which promotes and encourages the murder of Israeli Jews, has been widely condemned. In March 2018, the United States Congress passed the Taylor Force Act to cut aid to the Palestinians until they end their policy of giving reward payments to terrorists. The Biden administration has affirmed the United States position against these payments. Criticizing the Palestinian terror payments, EU official Johannes Hahn, then in charge of EU financial assistance to the Palestinians, stated in April 2019 that payments to Palestinian

³⁴ PA salaries to terrorists and their families, PMW (last visited July 1, 2019), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1005.

³⁵ Brig.-Gen. (res.) Yossi Kuperwasser, *Continued PA Payments to Terrorists in 2018 Underscore Need to Implement New Israeli Law*, JERUSALEM CENTER FOR PUBLIC AFFAIRS (December 10, 2018), http://jcpa.org/thesuc-2018-report-on-palestinian-authority-payments-of-salaries-to-terrorists-in-2018/.

³⁶ Maurice Hirsch and Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *PA salaries to terrorists rise by 11.8% in 2019 – amidst self-inflicted financial crisis*, PMW (July 3, 2019), http://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=27753.

³⁷ Maurice Hirsch, *PMW Exclusive: PA gives 517.4 million shekels to terrorists as salaries in 2019*, PMW (January 30, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/17309.

³⁸ Maurice Hirsch, Itamar Marcus and Nan Jacques Zilberdik, How much did the PA spend on terrorists' salaries in 2020? PMW (February 22, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18603.

³⁹ Maurice Hirsch, *PMW initiative creates havoc for the Pay-for-Slay policy*, PMW (May 17, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18659.

⁴⁰ Palestine Rejects US Proposal to Transfer Prisoners' Salaries to 'Social Welfare,' ASHARQ AL-AWSAT (January 27, 2022), https://english.aawsat.com/home/article/3439576/palestine-rejects-us-proposal-transfer-prisoners-salaries-social-welfare.

⁴¹ Congress passes Taylor Force act as part of \$1.3 trillion budget bill, TIMES OF ISRAEL (March 23, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/congress-passes-taylor-force-act-as-part-of-1-3-trillion-budget-bill/.

⁴² Jacob Magid, *Biden administration says it's pushing Ramallah to reform terror payment policy*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (June 23, 2021), https://www.timesofisrael.com/biden-administration-says-its-pushing-ramallah-to-reform-terror-payment-policy/.

terrorists and their families should be based on need only.⁴³ In March 2018, British lawmakers Joan Ryan and Ian Austin urged then-Prime Minister Theresa May to cut British aid to the PA by 14% over its payments to terrorists.⁴⁴ In the past, the United Kingdom has frozen part of its aid to the PA over such payments.⁴⁵

In response, President Mahmoud Abbas reiterated the PA's commitment to these payments, stating "even if we have only a penny left, we will give it to the martyrs, the prisoners and their families." That statement was aired again on PA TV in March 2021." ⁴⁷

Like the land laws, the "pay for slay laws" are aimed at keeping Jews out of areas controlled and claimed by the PA, thereby promoting apartheid in violation of ICERD Article 3.

II. ANTISEMITIC INCITEMENT BY PALESTINIAN OFFICIALS

ICERD Article 4 provides that State parties "shall not permit public authorities or public institutions...to promote or incite racial discrimination" and ICCPR Article 20 mandates State parties to prohibit "advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence." Yet the PA and Hamas unabashedly violate these provisions when their officials incite antisemitic racial hatred with impunity. Significantly, in as much as these statements deny Jewish rights in any part of Israel and reject Israel's right to exist, they also violate ICCPR Article 1 and ICESCR Article 1.

As documented below, themes repeated by Palestinian officials include:

- Jews have no historical connection to Palestine
- Israel and Zionism must be eliminated
- Palestine must be liberated from the Jordan River to the Mediterranean Sea
- Terrorists are heroes
- Jews are filthy
- Jews are usurers
- Jews control the world
- Jews are responsible for all the problems in the world
- Jews try to poison Palestinians

⁴³ Tovah Lazaroff, *EU Official Proposes Palestinian Terrorism Payments on Needs Basis*, JERUSALEM POST (April 30, 2019), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/EU-official-proposes-Palestinian-terrorism-payments-on-needs-basis-588326.

⁴⁴ Marcus Dysch, *Cut British aid to Palestinian Authority, Labour MPs tell May*, THE JEWISH CHRONICLE (March 1, 2018), https://www.thejc.com/news/uk-news/cut-british-taxpayers-aid-to-the-palestinian-authority-labour-mps-tell-prime-minister-theresa-may-1.459714.

⁴⁵ *UK freezes* \$30 million in Palestinian aid over salaries for terrorists, TIMES OF ISRAEL (October 7, 2016), https://www.timesofisrael.com/uk-freezes-30m-in-aid-to-palestinians-over-payments-to-terrorists/.

⁴⁶ Abbas vows to continue stipends to terrorists event with PA's 'last penny,' TIMES OF ISRAEL (July 24, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/abbas-vows-to-continue-stipends-to-terrorists-even-with-pas-last-penny/.

⁴⁷ PA TV repeats Abbas' vow to pay terrorists no matter what – even "if we are left with only one penny," PMW (March 13, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18660.

A. Incitement by Palestinian Authority President Mahmoud Abbas

Instead of prohibiting government officials from engaging in incitement to racial hatred as required by the international treaties to which the State of Palestine is a party, Palestinian officials at the highest level routinely broadcast such incitement.

President Abbas himself spreads antisemitic incitement in his public speeches and statements, including in these examples:

- **Repeating libel that Israel poisoned Arafat**: Speaking to members of the press in Cairo, Abbas suggested Israel was trying to kill him and said: "They can also kill me with poison, as they poisoned the late President Yasser Arafat..." (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, January 15, 2019). 48
- Glorifying and inciting terrorism: In a speech praising Palestinians who committed terrorist attacks against Israelis, Abbas said: "Even if we have only one penny left it will only be spent on the families of the Martyrs and the prisoners...[who are] paving the way for Palestine's independence...We view the Martyrs and prisoners as stars in the sky of the Palestinian people...and they have priority in everything." (Official PA TV, July 24, 2018). 49
- **Spewing classical antisemitism**: In a speech to the Palestinian National Council, the legislative body of the PLO, Abbas spewed classic antisemitism, claiming the Jews are not "Semites," that they are descendants of the "Khazar Kingdom," that Jews have no historical connection to the land of Israel, and arguing that the Jews of Europe were hated "not due to their religion, but rather due to their social role...that was connected to usury, and banks..." (*Official PA TV*, May 2, 2018). The speech was widely condemned as antisemitic, including by UN envoy Nickolay Mladenov, German Foreign Minister Heiko Maas, the European Union, the Swiss government, and several US officials. 51
- Blaming Israel for all the world's problems: In a speech on the Public Service Ethics Code, Abbas claimed: "The international community is becoming more and more convinced that the occupation of the Palestinian state by Israel is the reason for all the

⁴⁸ Abbas and Fatah official accuse Israel of inciting against the Palestinian leadership and attempting to assassinate Abbas, "as they poisoned" Arafat, PMW (January 15, 2019), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=834&doc_id=27187.

⁴⁹ Abbas vows continued payments to terrorist prisoners who are 'stars in the sky' and have 'priority in everything,' PMW (July 24, 2018), https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/videos/pal/videos.aspx?fild_id=latest&doc_id=26252. ⁵⁰ Jews' usury caused Antisemitism – speech by PA Chairman Abbas, PMW (May 2, 2018) https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=25581.

⁵¹ Noga Tarnopolsky, *Palestinian leader Abbas' comments on Holocaust condemned as anti-Semitic*, LA TIMES (May 2, 2018), https://www.latimes.com/world/middleeast/la-fg-palestinian-abbas-tirade-20180502-story.html; Switzerland deems Mahmoud Abbas's speech unacceptable, 'SWISS INFO (May 4, 2018), https://www.swissinfo.ch/eng/palestinian-national-council-switzerland-deems-mahmoud-abbas-s-speech-unacceptable-/44094196.

disasters that the region and the world are suffering from..." (Official PA TV, March 12, 2017).⁵²

- **Spewing antisemitic libel**: In a speech to the EU Parliament, Abbas spewed a classic antisemitic libel, stating that "Some Rabbis rose up in Israel and explicitly announced and demanded of their government that it poison the water in order to kill Palestinians." (*Official PA TV*, June 23, 2016).⁵³
- **Justifying terrorism**: In the midst of the 2015/2016 wave of terror referred to by some as the Jerusalem Intifada, after four Israelis had been killed in terror attacks, Abbas justified the attacks and blamed them on Israel, threatening: "the occupation is responsible for what is happening," and "the continuation of the settlers' provocation at the blessed Al-Aqsa Mosque will lead to disastrous consequences." (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, October 12, 2015).⁵⁴
- **Inciting to terrorism**: At the beginning of that wave of terror, Abbas incited terrorism saying: "We bless every drop of blood that has been spilled for Jerusalem" and referred to Jews as filthy saying: "The Al-Aqsa [Mosque] is ours...and they have no right to defile it with their filthy feet. We will not allow them to..." (Official PA TV, September 17, 2015). 55

B. Incitement by Other Palestinian Authority Officials

Following President Abbas's example, PA officials spew Jew-hatred and terrorist incitement as a matter of routine, including in the following examples.

- Blaming Israel for internal Palestinian violence: On PA TV, PA Security Forces Spokesman accused Israel of deliberately spreading weapons to create internal strife within Palestinian society, "Certainly, and especially in areas that have all kinds of social problems, we see these weapons being spread [by the occupation] in a noticeable manner...this occupation also certainly views the internal conflicts in the Palestinian society as a means of getting rid of confrontations that are part of the popular uprising (*i.e.*, term used by Palestinians, which also refers to the use of violence and terror) against this occupation." (Official PA TV, August 23, 2021). 56
- **Denying Israel's right to exist**: PA Grand Mufti Muhammad Hussein assured PA TV viewers that Israel's destruction is only a matter of time, "The injustice will certainly pass

https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=834&doc_id=20652.

https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=834&doc_id=18246.

⁵² Palestinian News Item, PMW (March 12, 2017),

⁵³ Palestinian News Item, PMW (June 23, 2016),

⁵⁴ Only days after 4 Israelis murdered, Abbas calls 'uprising' 'peaceful', inflames Palestinians, says Israel desecrates Al-Aqsa Mosque, PMW (October 12, 2015), https://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=827&doc id=17162. https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc id=15714

⁵⁶ Nan Jacques Zilberdik and Maurice Hirsch, You can always blame Israel! PA: Israel spreads weapons among Palestinians to fuel internal disputes, PMW (September 3, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29124.

and the occupation (i.e., Israel) will pass...Jerusalem will certainly be liberated and return to the embrace of Islam." (*Official PA TV*, September 29, 2021).⁵⁷

- **Denying Jewish ties to Temple Mount**: The PA routinely uses the Al Aqsa Mosque to incite violence against Jews. In July 2021, several PA officials accused Israel of trying to take over the Temple Mount. For example, PA Presidential Office Advisor Ahmed Al-Ruweidi said "Our position is clear: This is our land, this is our mosque, the Al-Aqsa Mosque with its entire territory of 144 dunams (*i.e.*, all of the Temple Mount and the Western Wall), and it is an exclusive right of the Muslims and no one shares this with them... 'What is happening at the blessed Al-Aqsa Mosque is laying the groundwork for a religious war that will reach you, your countries.'" (*Fatah Commission of Information and Culture Facebook Page*, July 18, 2021).⁵⁸
- **Antisemitic Libel**: Director of Palestinian Prisoner Club in Hebron Amjad al-Najjar accused Israel of deliberately harming Palestinian prisoners by using unqualified "Russian doctors [who] failed the 'Israeli Medical Association' test" to treat them. (*Official PA TV*, July 17, 2021).⁵⁹
- Inciting bombing of Israeli civilians: Fatah Central Committee member Abbas Zaki expressed praise and admiration for the May 2021 Hamas rocket attacks on Israeli civilians, posting the following on Facebook "Blessings to the rockets that placed Hamas- that put Israel on alert or put them in bomb shelters. They caused [Israelis] to hide." (*Fatah Central Committee Member Abbas Zaki Facebook Page*, May 30, 2021).⁶⁰
- **Glorifying terrorists**: PA officials praised terrorists imprisoned for killing Israelis. For example, Fatah Tulkarem Secretary Iyad Jarrad referred to such prisoners as "a crown on our heads." He said, "We must always welcome them, carry them aloft, and make speeches that worthy of them, their activities, and all our brave prisoners, because truly they are the spearhead of the Palestinian problem and they are a crown on our heads." (*Official PA TV*, April 9, 2021). 61
- Advocating genocide against the Jews: On Official PA TV, Fatah Deputy Secretary of Shuafat and Beit Hanina rejected a two-state solution, vowing that Jerusalem will never be divided—"Jerusalem is ours"—and that the Palestinians will continue to fight until all of

⁵⁷ Nan Jacques Zilberdik and Itamar Marcus, *Israel's destruction is inevitable – a repeating PA promise*, PMW (October 22, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29279.

⁵⁸ Itamar Marcus, *PA leaders continue to deny existence of Jewish Temples*, PMW (August 4, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/26049.

⁵⁹ Itamar Marcus, *New PA libel: Israel uses unqualified Russian doctors to treat Palestinian prisoners*, PMW (July 21, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/26024.

⁶⁰ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Senior Fatah official supports Hamas rockets "that put Israel in bomb shelters*," PMW (June 14, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/23945.

⁶¹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Terrorist murderers are "a crown on our heads,"- PA Ministry of Health and Fatah*, PMW (June 4, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/23859.

Palestine is "liberated" from "the [Mediterranean] Sea to the [Jordan] River." (Official PA TV, May 18, 2021).⁶²

• Inciting violence against Israel: Top PA and Fatah leader Jibril Rajoub incited further violence against Israel in the wake of the May 2021 conflict with Hamas. On the last day of the war, referring to Israel's "fascist and Nazi state terror," he stated that unless "the world will give us a solution," "we will continue the cycle of blood and killing." (Fatah Commission of Information and Culture Facebook Page, May 20, 2021). 63

C. Incitement by Hamas Officials

Likewise, Hamas officials routinely call for the destruction of Israel and include antisemitic motifs in their speeches. Some examples are excerpted below.

- **Denying Israel's right to exist**: Hamas co-founder Mahmoud Al-Zahar responding to a journalist who asked whether Israel has a right to exist: "No. Why? Why? You are coming from America and you take my house. You came from Britain and you took my brother's house. This is a settlement. You are not a citizen. We are the owners of this. This is an Arabic area. This is well-known as an Islamic area, well-known." (*Sky News*, May 24, 2021).⁶⁴
- Calling for Israel's destruction: Deputy Chairman of the Hamas politburo Musa Abu Marzouk proclaimed "This [May 2021 conflict] is not the final war. It's not like it was in Vietnam and elsewhere, where things ended up with negotiations. This is just one of a [series] of wars, and a war will come when we negotiate with them about the end of their occupation, and their leaving of Palestine. Israel will come to an end just like it began, and our Palestinian people will return to their homes, because injustice cannot last and people must get what is rightly theirs." (Russia Today, May 17, 2021). 65
- **Inciting murder of Jews**: Hamas politburo member Fathi Hamad urged the people of Jerusalem to purchase five-shekel knives and "cut off the heads of the Jews." (*Al-Aqsa TV*, May 7, 2021).⁶⁶
- Antisemitic incitement: Hamas politburo member Fathi Hamed called to kill all Jews. He said, "Seven million Palestinians outside, enough warming up, you have Jews with you in

⁶²Itamar Marcus, *Fatah*: "Palestine from the Sea to the River" – will be liberated, PMW (May 30, 2012), https://palwatch.org/page/23846.

⁶³ Itamar Marcus, "We will continue the cycle of blood and killing," threatens Fatah leader Rajoub – "We are not the only ones who will die," PMW (May 25, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/23833.

⁶⁴ Hamas co-founder to UK TV: Israel has no right to exist, TIMES OF ISRAEL (May 24, 2021), https://www.timesofisrael.com/hamas-co-founder-to-uk-tv-israel-has-no-right-to-exist/.

⁶⁵ Deputy Chairman of Hamas Political Bureau Musa Abu Marzouk: Israel Will Go The Way Of The USSR And Berlin Wall, MEMRI (May 17, 2021), https://www.memri.org/tv/musa-abu-marzouk-dpe-chairman-hamas-politburo-israel-go-ussr-berlin-wall-negotiate-end-occupation.

⁶⁶ Senior Hamas Official Fathi Hammad To Palestinians In Jerusalem: Buy 5-Shekel Knives And Cut Off The Heads Of The Jews, MEMRI (May 7, 2021), https://www.memri.org/tv/snr-hamas-official-fathi-hammad-urges-people-jerusalem-cut-off-heads-jews-knives-day-reckoning-moment-destruction.

every place. You should attack every Jew possible in all the world and kill them." (*Video to March of Return Participants reported by Al Arabiya*, July 2019).⁶⁷

- Antisemitic incitement: Senior Hamas official Ismail Radwan rallied rioters at Gaza March of Return, referring multiple times to the Jews as "apes and pigs" who "will be burned," and adding that "the Jews and Zionists are your enemies and the enemies of the Arab and Islamic nation." (*Ismail Radwan's Facebook Page*, December 27, 2018).⁶⁸
- Antisemitic incitement: Hamas leader Ismail Haniyeh rallied Gaza rioters with antisemitic chants such as the famous call to kill the Jews, "Khaybar, Khaybar, O Jews, the army of Muhammad will return," cries of "death to Israel," and the promise to eliminate Israel "we shall never forget Palestine from the [Mediterranean] Sea to the [Jordan] River." (*Palestinian Web Sources*, May 11, 2018).⁶⁹
- **Inciting terrorism and murder:** Hamas Gaza leader Yehya Sinwar rallied Gaza March of Return rioters, proclaiming "We will tear down the border and we will tear out their hearts from their bodies." (*Al Jazeera*, April 6, 2018).⁷⁰

III. ANTISEMITIC INCITEMENT IN PALESTINIAN MEDIA AND EDUCATION

Aside from the aforementioned ICERD Article 4 and ICCPR Article 7 on prohibiting racial incitement, several international treaty provisions specifically concern children's right to an education that promotes "tolerance and understanding" including among different "racial, ethnic or religious groups." (*e.g.*, ICERD Article 7; ICESCR Article 13; CRC Article 29). Yet in violation of these provisions, both Palestinian media and education are used as tools to disseminate antisemitic propaganda and incitement.

A. Incitement Against Jews and Israelis in Palestinian Media

The PA and Hamas routinely use their state-controlled mass media (television, radio, print, and social media) to demonize Israel, propagate antisemitism, celebrate martyrdom and incite terrorism, including in media specifically aimed at a child audience. PA and Hamas media also expressly encourage children to engage in violence by using images of children committing violence to promote such activities, and by hosting children who profess support for martyrdom through poems, songs, and statements. Thus, instead of being used to "combat prejudices" and

⁶⁷ Hamas official condemned after calling on Palestinians to kill Jews, AL ARABIYA (July 15, 2019), https://english.alarabiya.net/News/middle-east/2019/07/15/Hamas-official-condemned-after-calling-on-Palestinians-to-kill-Jews.

⁶⁸ A senior Hamas figure delivers a speech replete with anti-Semitic motifs, THE MEIR AMIT INTELLIGENCE AND TERRORISM INFORMATION CENTER (December 27, 2018), https://www.terrorism-info.org.il/en/senior-hamas-figure-delivers-speech-replete-anti-semitic-motifs-yet-another-expression-hamass-long-standing-tradition-anti-semitism/.

⁶⁹ Amid antisemitic and "death to Israel" chants, Hamas political bureau chairman Ismail Haniyeh vows: We shall never recognize Israel, MEMRI (May 11, 2018), https://www.memri.org/tv/hamas-political-bureau-head-haniyeh-we-shall-never-recognize-israel.

⁷⁰ @Ostrov_A, TWITTER (May 15, 2018, 11:09 AM), https://twitter.com/Ostrov_A/status/996301534718844928.

"promote tolerance and understanding," the Palestinian media is used to enhance prejudice and preach hatred and violence against Jews.

1. Examples of classic antisemitism

- Official Palestinian television likens then-Israeli MP (now Prime Minister) Naftali Bennett to notorious Nazi Adolf Eichmann "What Eichmann did to the Jews in Austria, they're doing [Israeli Parliament Member] Naftali Bennett is doing to us, exactly." (Official PA TV, April 6, 2021).⁷¹
- In honor of International Holocaust Remembrance Day, Official Palestinian television tells its viewers that the Holocaust was the price Jews had to pay for their "conspiracies and wickedness." (*Official PA TV*, January 23. 2021).⁷²
- Official Fatah Facebook Page shares a video produced by Fatah's Commission of Information and Culture depicting Jews as "arrogant" people who "schemed to exploit others' material and human resources..." (*Fatah Facebook Page*, July 2019).⁷³
- Fatah website posts op-ed arguing that Shakespeare's Shylock was an accurate description of the Jews. "William Shakespeare correctly described the deceitful, greedy, trickster extortionist and lowly character of the Jews in the story." (*Falestinona*, January 31, 2018).⁷⁴
- Palestinian media routinely publishes antisemitic cartoons:



⁷¹ Maurice Hirsch, *PA TV: What Eichmann did to the Jews, Israeli MP Bennett is doing to us*, PMW (April 12, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/19693.

⁷² *PA: The Holocaust was Europe repaying Jews for their "wickedness,"* PMW (January 26, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18526.

⁷³ Fatah: Jews allied with Nazi Germany to burn Jews for profit, PMW (July 15, 2019), https://palwatch.org/page/16408.

⁷⁴ Antisemitic Fatah Op-ed, PMW (January 31, 2018), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1100&doc_id=25136.

Cartoon posted on Fatah website shows antisemitic depiction of Jews with a big nose, Star of David and Israeli military uniform receiving the Balfour declaration as a check for the territory of "Palestine." (*Falestinona*, December 2, 2017).⁷⁵

Official PA newspaper publishes cartoon depicting Israel controlling the United States which controls the world. (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, October 4, 2016).⁷⁶



Official PA newspaper publishes cartoon showing Jews crucifying Palestinian boy, while Israeli soldier watches and does nothing. (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, December 2, 2015).⁷⁷



Cartoon published on Fatah website depicts Israelis as Nazis (*Website of Fatah Information and Culture Commission*, November11, 2015).⁷⁸

2. Examples of demonizing Israel and Jews

- Official Palestinian television broadcasts animated cartoon likening Israel to the coronavirus. The cartoon depicts an image of the Dome of the Rock between an Israeli soldier in a green helmet and a green coronavirus orb with the caption "Jerusalem between two viruses." (Official PA TV, October 16, 2021).⁷⁹
- Palestinian military expert Wasef Erekat spreads libel that Israeli rabbis indoctrinate Jewish children to "kill whoever is not Jewish..." to "kill the Palestinian children." (Official PA TV, January 6, 2021).

https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=1100&doc id=24542.

http://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=1100&doc_id=16952

http://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=1100&doc id=16351.

⁷⁵ Fatah cartoon shows anti-Semitic depiction of a Jew receiving the Balfour Declaration as a check with map of "Palestine" on it, PMW (December 2, 2017),

⁷⁶ Cartoon in PA daily: Israel controls the US which controls the world, PMW (October 4, 2016), https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=1100&doc_id=18877.

⁷⁷ Palestinian News Item, PMW (December 2, 2015),

⁷⁸ Fatah cartoon: Israelis are Nazis, PMW (November 11, 2015),

⁷⁹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Corona breathes new life into PA demonization of Israel*, PMW (November 1, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29333.

⁸⁰ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, "Israeli rabbis indoctrinate Jewish kids: Kill the Palestinian children – Palestinian "expert" libels Israel, PMW (January 15, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18504.

- Official Palestinian television's Best Home program for children teaches that Israel "is deliberately killing Palestinian children." (*Official PA TV*, November 21, 2020). 81
- Hamas television portrays Jews as inherent haters of all Arabs who teach their children to hate Arabs. (*Al-Aqsa TV*, August 29, 2020). 82
- Official PA daily publishes op-ed describing Israel as "the colonialist satanic plant" in the region and the "Zionist project" as "a project that rejects life." (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, April 5, 2018).⁸³
 - 3. Examples of denying Jewish rights in Israel
- Gazan girl recites poem on official Palestinian television denying Israel's right to exist: "Palestine will remain for the Palestinians; From the [Mediterranean Sea [to] the [Jordan] River; They are the owners of the land." (*Official PA TV*, September 21, 2021).⁸⁴
- Official Palestinian television host recites poem claiming all of Israel is Palestine: "Haifa is mine, Jaffa is mine (*i.e.*, Israeli cities), Al-Aqsa is mine, Jerusalem is mine, and my land is mine from my [Jordan] River to my [Mediterranean] Sea." (*Official PA TV*, August 20, 2021).⁸⁵
- In a video on Hamas Ministry Facebook page, daughter of Hamas Minister proclaims the Palestinians will "return to our land Palestine from the [Jordan] River to the [Mediterranean] Sea; the Gaza Strip, the West Bank, Jerusalem, and the 1948 [territories] (i.e., Israel)" and vows that "Israel will be destroyed." (*Hamas Ministry of Internal Affairs Facebook Page*, May 19, 2021). 86
- Official PA newspaper publishes op-ed rejecting Jewish rights in Israel, claiming Jewish settlement in the land was due to the West's desire to "get rid of the Jewish problem in its lands" and its colonialist aspirations to undermine "the unity of the Arab nation's peoples..." (*Al-Hayat Al-Jadida*, January 26, 2021).⁸⁷

⁸¹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, PA libel: Israel "is deliberately killing the Palestinian children" – PA TV host demonizes Israel on kids' program, PMW (November 24, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/18390.

⁸² Nan Jacques Zilberdik, "All Jews hate all Arabs and want to kill them" – Hamas demonizes Jews in TV series, PMW (September 27, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/18251.

⁸³ Op-ed in official PA daily, PMW (April 5, 2018), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1100&doc_id=25430.

⁸⁴ Nan Jacques Zilberdik and Itamar Marcus, "Palestine" erases all of Israel "from the [Mediterranean] Sea to the [Jordan] River" in poem recited by Gazan girl on PA TV, PMW (October 14, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29240.

⁸⁵ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, "Haifa is mine, Jaffa is mine...My land is mine – from my river to my sea," PA TV – all of Israel is "Palestine" to be liberated, PMW (September 5, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29132.

⁸⁶ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Hamas' abuse of kids in Gaza: "If we die, we'll dies as Martyrs" – Hamas spokesman's young daughter*, PMW (June 6, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/23876.

⁸⁷ Itamar Marcus, Europeans created Zionism "to get rid of the Jewish problem in its lands" – op-ed in official PA daily, PMW (January 31, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18538.

- Official Palestinian radio host refers to Israel as a "cancerous entity," and says that "everyone knows that... [the Jews] have no right to this land." (*Official PA Radio*, January 1, 2018).⁸⁸
 - 4. Examples of inciting and glorifying terrorism
- On the same day as a deadly terrorist attack in which three Israelis were shot, one of whom later died of his wounds, the Fatah Facebook page posted a song inciting terror attacks: "O self-sacrificing fighter, make sure your bullet hits the target." (Fatah Facebook Page Nablus Branch, May 3, 2021).
- PA television broadcast quizzes children on songs with "value and meanings" which PA considers expression of Palestinian "national identity." One of the songs depicts Israel as the "enemy" and encourages armed attacks: "I'm coming with my rifle... I'm coming towards you, my enemy... with cleavers and knives." (Official PA TV, January 2021). 90
- Fatah Facebook page promotes child soldiers by sharing video of Jordanian boy in military uniform holding slingshot and rifle. He wants to "shoot Jews" who killed terrorist Omar Abu Laila (Palestinian who killed Israeli soldier, stole his weapon and shot to death Israeli father of 12). (Official Fatah Facebook Page, February 17, 2020). 91
- Hamas TV program celebrates and incites suicide bombings against Israelis. In the program, an actor playing an imprisoned Palestinian terrorist, cries because he did not get to carry out a suicide bombing. Another prisoner tells him to "be strong, and Allah willing, your being here [in prison] is no less than [what he did]. Allah willing you are destined for a reward." (*Al-Aqsa TV*, August 29, 2020). 92
- Hamas Political Bureau member Khalil Al-Hayya incites against Israel, proclaiming "we are saying to the occupation that we are primed and ready, and our hands are squeezing the trigger…" (*Al-Aqsa TV*, August 23, 2020).⁹³

https://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=1100&doc id=24835.

⁸⁸ PA radio host, PMW (January 1, 2018),

⁸⁹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Fatah*: "Make sure your bullets hit the target" – song posted just hours after lethal shooting attack, PMW (May 9, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/21754.

⁹⁰ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Which songs define Palestinian "cultural and…national identity?"* PMW (January 24, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/18520.

⁹¹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *Child abuse: Fatah Facebook promotes child soldiers and child martyrdom!* PMW (February 19, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/17461.

⁹² Nan Jacques Zilberdik, Hamas glorifies suicide bombings, promises imprisoned terrorists will get "reward" from Allah, PMW (September 10, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/18217.

⁹³ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, *One day of Hamas TV hate and terror messages*, PMW (September 7, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/18206.

B. Incitement Against Jews and Israelis in Palestinian Education

Similarly, instead of using the educational system to train the next generation in "tolerance and understanding," the PA and Hamas direct all of their educational resources for the opposite purpose. This is evident from statements by PA educational officials and staff inciting children to terrorism, the hateful content of the PA curriculum, the naming of schools, summer camps, and educational activities after terrorists, and the use of educational activities and events to promote violence.

1. Statements by PA educators promoting hatred and violence

PA educational officials and staff routinely praise and honor terrorists at school events, inciting the children to become martyrs, and at the same time reject Israel's right to exist, claiming Israel as Palestine. The PA also plays a key role in the curriculum taught by UNRWA, and influences its Palestinian teachers, who were found to be systematically inciting antisemitism and Jihadist terrorism against Jews. An August 2021 report by United Nations Watch listed 113 such examples documented since 2015.⁹⁴ Thus, instead of teaching acceptance and respect for their Jewish and Israeli neighbors, these caregivers are driving children to kill Jews and Israelis.

Palestinian President Mahmoud Abbas has personally encouraged child terrorists. On March 5, 2017, his Facebook page posted a photo of Abbas embracing 14-year-old Osama Zeidat who was injured while attempting to stab Israelis at a bus stop. ⁹⁵ In September 2015, Abbas hosted an event for 12-year-old Palestinian rock-thrower Muhammad al-Tamimi, praising the boy and his family for their so-called "peaceful resistance." ⁹⁶



Abbas embraces would-be child stabber (March 2017).



Below are some additional examples of PA educators inciting children to hatred and violence:

⁹⁴ Beyond the Textbooks: A Report Exposing UNRWA Teachers' Incitement to Antisemitism and Terrorism, UN Watch (August 2021), https://unwatch.org/report-un-teachers-celebrate-deaths-of-israelis/.

⁹⁵ Abbas kisses 14-year-old stabber, PMW (March 5, 2017),

 $[\]underline{http://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=339\&doc_id=21039.}$

⁹⁶ PA promotes rock throwing and self-sacrifice for Al-Aqsa Mosque, PMW (September 16, 2015), http://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=15707.

- **Rejecting Israel's right to exist**: Emphasizing the importance of "instilling the ideology that Palestine from the [Mediterranean] Sea to the [Jordan] River is Arab and Jerusalem its eternal capital." —Secretary of the Teachers' Office of the Fatah Movement, Tawfiq al-Haj Muhammad (December 27, 2017). 97
- Glorifying martyrdom: "The Palestinian keffiyeh has been colored with the purest blood, the blood of Martyrs (Shahids) of Palestine during their resistance to the occupation, and the keffiyeh has become the shroud of the Palestinian fighter who has sacrificed his soul for the homeland." —Director of the Qalqilya Directorate of Education (a branch of the PA Ministry of Education) Naela Fahmawi (November 17, 2017). 98
- **Honoring terrorists**: "It is a joy for all of us to mark Prisoners Day as part of our national obligation," emphasizing that "we are standing by the prisoners in the battle that they are waging under the leadership of fighter Marwan Barghouti [terrorist who orchestrated three shooting attacks killing five]..." —School Principal Sa'eda Qatanani (April 19, 2017). 99
- **Praising martyrs**: "We are unable to speak when among us are the fathers of two young wonderful Martyrs (Shahids), who gave their lives as a gift to the homeland, as a gift so that you...will enjoy freedom. They are praised and distinguished, and Paradise is their place." —PA Directorate of Education representative at school event (April 26, 2016). 100
 - 2. School curriculum indoctrinates children to hatred and violence

Several recent studies of PA textbooks show that the Palestinian curriculum does the opposite of promoting "tolerance and understanding," and instead radicalizes Palestinian children. In May 2020, the European Parliament condemned the PA in this regard, expressing concern "that problematic material in Palestinian school textbooks has still not been removed" and "about the continued failure to act effectively against hate speech and violence in school textbooks." The European Parliament stated that EU funds should be used only to draft "curricula which reflects UNESCO standards of peace, tolerance, coexistence, and non-violence." 101

IMPACT-se, an NGO dedicated to reviewing school textbooks for compliance with UNESCO standards of peace and tolerance, conducts regular reviews of Palestinian textbooks.

http://www.palwatch.org/site/modules/print/preview.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=24813.

⁹⁷ Palestinian education official, PMW (December 27, 2017)

⁹⁸ PA education official glorifies Martyrdom at high school event, PMW (November 17, 2017) http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=24244.

⁹⁹ PA high school hosts released terrorist who participated in kidnapping-murder of 16-year-old Israeli, PMW (April 19, 2017), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=20951.

¹⁰⁰ PA Directorate of Education representative at event at school commemorating terrorist who killed 3, PMW (April 24, 2016), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=19423.

¹⁰¹ Report on discharge in respect of the implementation of the general budget of the European Union for the financial year 2018, Section III – Commission and executive agencies, European Parliament, Doc. No. A9-0069/2020 (March 3, 2020), https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/A-9-2020-0069 EN.pdf; Raphael Ahren and TOI Staff, EU parliament passes resolution condemning hate speech in Palestinian textbooks, TIMES OF ISRAEL (May 15, 2020), https://www.timesofisrael.com/eu-parliament-passes-resolution-condemning-hate-speech-in-palestinian-textbooks/.

IMPACT-se's most recent study—covering 2020 to 2021—found that the Palestinian curriculum had "moved further from meeting UNESCO standards," contained "a systematic insertion of violence, martyrdom and jihad across all grades and subjects," and "rejected" the possibility of peace with Israel. ¹⁰²

Concerningly, these same textbooks are used by UNRWA, which is unique among UN agencies in that it provides government-like services to its constituents, including healthcare and education. UNRWA operates 711 schools for 526,000 students with over 22,000 educational staff. In addition to violating various international treaties as noted above, the textbook content that incites terrorism and racism also violates UN and UNRWA internal policies concerning staff neutrality and impartiality. Attempts by UNRWA to change this curriculum have been met with fierce resistance by the PA. In 2017, the PA Ministry of Education categorically opposed any attempt by UNRWA to alter the curriculum in a way that would contradict the philosophy of the PA with respect to "Palestinian national identity and heritage," which in this case refers to the belief that Jews have no rights in Palestine and that Palestinians will one day return to their ancestors' former homes in Israel. In Israel.

The findings in the latest report by IMPACT-se should be alarming to anyone who supports the Israeli-Palestinian peace process and the two-state solution. Examples from the report include:

- Fourth grade math textbook teaches addition in word problems using the number of martyrs in different Palestinian uprisings—"The number of martyrs of the First Intifada (the Intifada of Rocks) is 1,392 martyrs, and the number of martyrs of the Al-Aqsa Intifada is 4,673. The number of martyrs in the two intifadas is ____ martyrs."
- Fifth grade Arabic textbook teaches reading comprehension with a detailed 10-page text on the terrorist Dalal Mughrabi, perpetrator of the 1978 Coastal Road massacre which exalts her "heroism" and celebrates the massacre as "immortal" in the "hearts and minds" of Palestinians.
- Eleventh grade history textbook implies that Jews control the world, using classic antisemitic imagery of an arm with a Star of David holding a globe under the caption "Cultural Colonialism: The Most Dangerous Type of Colonialism, Because It Attacks the Spirit of the Nation and Its Beliefs."
- Seventh grade science textbook teaches Newton's Second Law with an image of a masked Palestinian boy aiming a slingshot at approaching soldiers.

103 What we do: education, UNRWA (last visited May 13, 2021), https://www.unrwa.org/what-we-do/education.

¹⁰² The 2020-21 Palestinian School Curriculum Grades 1-12, IMPACT-SE (May 2021), https://www.impact-se.org/wp-content/uploads/PA-Reports -Updated-Selected-Examples May-2021.pdf.

¹⁰⁴ PA Ministry of Education strongly opposes any attempt by UNRWA to change PA curriculum and schoolbooks, PMW (November 8, 2017), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=122&doc_id=24274.

3. Turning terrorists who murdered Jews and Israelis into role models for children

The PA has a practice of using school names to honor terrorists and glorify martyrdom, thereby turning terrorists into role models for children. Children studying at these schools have expressed the aspiration to "reach the level" of the terrorist for whom the school is named. According to Palestinian Media Watch (PMW), dozens of PA Ministry of Education Schools are named for terrorists. 106

In September 2017, a scandal erupted when PMW exposed that a PA elementary school named after the terrorist Dalal Mughrabi (leader of a terrorist attack that killed 37 Israelis, including 13 children) was funded with money from Belgium. Belgium condemned the use of its funding to glorify terrorists, stating it "will not allow itself to be associated with the names of terrorists in any way," and demanded that the name of the school be changed. However, one year later, the school name had still not been changed. Finally, after being exposed again, the PA renamed the school "The Belgian School," but transferred the name Dalal Mughrabi to two other schools. This time, Belgium withdrew its cooperation from the PA Ministry of Education and released this statement: "As long as school names are used to glorify terrorism, Belgium can no longer cooperate with the Palestinian Education Ministry and will not give out budgets for the constructions of schools." PA schools are also named for Munich Olympics mastermind Abu Iyad and Hamas terror leader Ahmed Yassin, among others.

This abhorrent practice is not limited to schools. Palestinian youth centers, summer camps, and sporting events also are frequently named for terrorists. In May 2017, Norway froze all new funding agreements with UN Women Palestine, after Norwegian funds were used to build a youth center named after Dalal Mughrabi. Norwegian Foreign Minister Børge Brende strongly condemned the incident stating: "The glorification of terrorist attacks is completely unacceptable, and I deplore this decision in the strongest possible terms. Norway will not allow itself to be associated with institutions that take the names of terrorists in this way. We will not accept the use of Norwegian aid funding for such purposes." 110

Notwithstandong these public reprimands by donor countries, the practice continues. In 2020, PA President Mahmoud Abbas's Fatah party named a summer camp for high school boys after Omar Abu Laila who was killed by Israeli soldiers in the course of carrying out a terrorist

¹⁰⁵ See, e.g., Palestinian girl's goal: "to reach the level" of terrorist who killed 37, PMW (April 14, 2014), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=11243.

¹⁰⁶ Names of schools in the PA, PMW (last visited February 21, 2019), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=608. ¹⁰⁷ Belgium cuts PA funding based on PMW report, PMW (September 20, 2018), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=26338.

¹⁰⁸ Belgian funded PA school still named after terrorist mass murderer, PMW (July 31, 2018), http://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=26161.

¹⁰⁹ Belgium ends cooperation with PA education over school named for terrorist, 124 NEWS (September 15, 2018), https://www.i24news.tv/en/news/middle-east-ar/184247-180915-belgium-ends-funding-to-palestinian-education-over-school-named-for-terrorist.

¹¹⁰ Norway freezes funds to UN Women Palestine over center named for terrorist, UN WATCH (May 28, 2017), https://www.unwatch.org/norway-freezes-funds-un-women-palestine-center-named-terrorist/.

attack in which he murdered two Israelis. Photos of the camp showed the participants dressed in military uniform and holding a symbolic funeral for the "martyr" Omar Abu Laila. 111

4. Exploiting educational activities to train children in terrorism

Both the PA and Hamas turn educational activities into platforms to teach hate and violence. For example, every year Hamas runs summer camps in which it trains children in military tactics and weapons use. This year's Hamas summer camps where kids learned to handle weapons (*see* images below) and kidnap soldiers were widely publicized in the news and on social media. 113



¹

¹¹¹ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, Fatah camp for youth named after murderer, PMW (June 10, 2020), https://palwatch.org/page/17962.

¹¹² COGAT: Hamas summer camp trains kids to 'commit acts of terror,' JERUSALEM POST (June 11, 2020), https://www.jpost.com/middle-east/cogat-reports-hamas-summer-camp-back-in-session-595804; Hamas opens registration for annual summer camp, I24 NEWS (July 15, 2019),

https://www.i24news.tv/en/news/international/middle-east/1562832005-hamas-launches-annual-summer-camp; As part of Hamas summer camps, children and youths undergo military and paramilitary training at the military wing's outposts and facilities, THE MEIR AMIT INTELLIGENCE AND TERRORISM INFORMATION CENTER (August 9, 2018), https://www.terrorism-info.org.il/en/part-hamas-summer-camps-children-youths-undergo-military-training-military-wings-outposts-facilities/.

¹¹³ See, e.g., Hamas Summer Camp Trains Youths to Fire Guns, Kidnap Soldiers, I24 NEWS (July 5, 2021), https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ibS9yyqocfI; Amelia Navins, Hamas' Summer Indoctrination Camps for 50,000 Children, JCPA (July 12, 2021), https://jcpa.org/hamas-summer-indoctrination-camps-for-50000-children/; @NGOmonitor, TWITTER (June 8, 2021, 3:39PM), https://twitter.com/NGOmonitor/status/1402243926451425284; @Jtruzmah, TWITTER (June 14, 2021, 12:01 PM), https://twitter.com/Jtruzmah/status/1404363343956164611.





Likewise, summer camps run by Fatah and the PLO teach children to venerate famous Palestinian martyrs like Abu Jihad, who was responsible for terror attacks in which 125 Israelis were killed. In one summer 2021 Fatah camp for the "Lion Clubs and Flowers," children were taught to glorify and praise Palestinian prisoners and martyrs, *i.e.*, terrorists who attacked Israel. Even after summer ended, the PA continued to operate camp-like activities. For example, the PA's police academy operated a camp program for 50 female high school students in which the teenagers were taught to view the female terrorist Dalal Mughrabi as a role model. In the continued to operate camp-like activities.

In school plays, child actors pretend to be Palestinian victims of Israeli aggression who fight back with weapons. A recent school play in the West Bank village of Rantis demonized Jews by depicting them shooting Palestinians. A school play from 2016 demonized Israel, having Israeli soldiers frame a Palestinian youth as a stabber by planting a knife next to him and then shooting him in cold blood. 118

General community activities also promote violence and martyrdom to children. A YouTube video from a 2016 Islamic Association child festival in Gaza displayed images of young boys dressed as Hamas fighters exiting a Hamas tunnel with rifles, dancing with their rifles, and capturing Israeli soldiers. A girl narrates, encouraging children to die as martyrs: "Forward, my child, to the duel. You will die as a Martyr (Shahid) and blow up the enemies." 119

¹¹⁴ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, What did you learn in camp today? To "praise" terrorists, admire "Martyrs," and erase Israel, PMW (August 5, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/26048.

¹¹⁶ Nan Jacques Zilberdik, PA Police and Fatah teach 50 girls to see terrorist murderer Mughrabi as role model, PMW (October 26, 2021), https://palwatch.org/page/29307.

¹¹⁷ Palestinian schools mark 104 years of Balfour Declaration with displays of hate, JNS (November 4, 2021), https://www.jns.org/palestinian-schools-mark-104-years-of-balfour-declaration-with-displays-of-hate/.

¹¹⁸ PA schools use plays to teach murder and hate, PMW (May 25, 2016), http://palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=157&doc_id=18005.

¹¹⁹ Child festival in Gaza promotes child Martyrdom, killing and violence, PMW (May 5, 2016), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=18218.



Young boys dressed as Hamas fighters exiting a tunnel at Gaza child festival



Young boys dressed as Hamas fighters capture boy dressed as Israeli soldier at Gaza festival

Similarly, at a Fatah ceremony in Bethlehem celebrating the launch of the first Intifada, children marched in the procession holding RPGs and explosive belts, and wearing T-shirts honoring 19-year-old Jihad Al-Jaafari as a martyr for being killed after throwing a Molotov cocktail at Israeli soldiers. ¹²⁰



Child holding RPG at Fatah ceremony



Child wearing explosive vest at Fatah ceremony

Palestinian misuse of its educational system to indoctrinate Palestinian youth to hatred and violence violates international treaties to which the State of Palestine is a party and undermines the prospects for a two-state solution.

IV. PALESTINIAN RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION

Pursuant to ICERD Article 5, State parties must prohibit and eliminate racial discrimination and guarantee certain rights, including the right to personal safety, the right to own property, and basic civil liberties such as freedom of religion. Similarly, ICCPR Article 26 enshrines the right to equal protection of the law, and specifically provides that the law must "prohibit any discrimination and guarantee to all persons equal and effective protection against discrimination on any ground such as race...religion...national or social origin..." Furthermore, both the ICCPR and CRC guaranty the rights to life (ICCPR Article 6 and CRC Article 6) and to freedom of

_

¹²⁰ Palestinian children wear "explosive belts" and hold toy guns and RPGs in procession celebrating Fatah's 51st anniversary, PMW (January 8, 2016), http://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=339&doc_id=16905.

thought, conscience and religion (ICCPR Article 18 and CRC Article 14). Both the PA and Hamas violate these provisions as detailed below.

A. Palestinian Authority Fails to protect Israelis from violence

The PA and Hamas fail to guarantee protection to Israelis who enter territories under their control, even by accident. Indeed, for more than six years, Hamas has held captive two Israelis who crossed into Gaza by mistake—a 29-year-old Israeli Bedouin who entered Gaza in September 2015 and a 30-year-old Israeli Ethiopian who entered Gaza in April 2015, both of whom suffer from mental illness. Hamas continues to hold these young men incommunicado without providing information on their location, permitting contact with the families, or allowing Red Cross visits. Page 122

In addition, Israeli law forbids its citizens from entering the parts of the West Bank controlled by the PA because of the likelihood they will be attacked. ¹²³ Over the years, there have been numerous cases of Israelis entering such areas, often by accident, and being attacked by local Palestinians. Israelis still vividly recall with horror the bloody lynching of two Israeli reservists who entered Ramallah by mistake at the beginning of the Second Intifada in October 2000. The men were brutally stabbed and beaten to death and their mutilated bodies were dragged to the town square. ¹²⁴ In February 2018, two Israeli soldiers were wounded after they accidentally entered Jenin and were attacked by a Palestinian mob who threw rocks at them and banged on their car. ¹²⁵

Below are some examples of similar attacks on Israeli civilians:

- On December 1, 2021, two Israelis were attacked by a Palestinian mob and their car set on fire after they entered the town of Ramallah by mistake. 126
- On February 2, 2018, an Israeli man was rescued after accidentally entering the Palestinian town of Abu Dis and being attacked by rock-throwers. 127

¹²¹ Raphael Ahren, *Families of Israeli civilians held in Gaza hold joint prayer, appeal to Hamas*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (September 6, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/families-of-israeli-civilians-held-in-gaza-hold-joint-prayer-appeal-to-hamas/.

appeal-to-hamas/.

122 2 Israelis Who Entered Gaza Held Incommunicado, HUMAN RIGHTS WATCH (May 2, 2017), https://www.hrw.org/news/2017/05/03/2-israelis-who-entered-gaza-held-incommunicado.

¹²³ Israeli family accidentally enters Palestinian town, returned safely, TIMES OF ISRAEL (July 8, 2017).

Adiv Sterman, 'We were in a craze to see blood,' TIMES OF ISRAEL (December 25, 2013), https://www.timesofisrael.com/we-were-in-a-craze-to-see-blood/.

¹²⁵ Adam Rasgon, *IDF Soldiers Rescued by PA Security Forces After Accidentally Entering Jenin*, JERUSALEM POST (February 12, 2018), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/IDF-soldiers-assailed-by-Palestinians-after-accidentally-entering-Jenin-542398.

¹²⁶ Palestinian mob attacks 2 Israelis in Ramallah who entered city by accident, YNET (December 1, 2021), https://www.ynetnews.com/article/h1ckgsrfy.

¹²⁷ Elior Levy, Yishai Porat, Yoav Zitun, *Israeli enters Abu Dis and is attacked, his vehicle torched*, YNET (February 2, 2018), https://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-5079878,00.html.

- On January 9, 2018, two Czech tourists were rescued by police after accidentally entering the Palestinian village of Teqoa. Their car was attacked with rocks and slightly damaged during the rescue.¹²⁸
- On June 30, 2016, nine Israeli peace activists were rescued from Ramallah after they were attacked with rocks and one of their cars was set on fire. 129
- On May 16, 2014, two Israeli journalists were attacked while covering clashes near Beitunia in the West Bank. 130
- On June 27, 2011, an Israeli man was rescued by a local Mukhtar after making a wrong turn into the East Jerusalem village of Issawiya. The man was immediately attacked by a murderous crowd screaming "Jew, Jew" and hurling rocks and cement blocks at him. 131

While PA security officers often assist in the rescue of these Israelis, we are not aware of PA prosecutions against the Palestinians who participate in such attacks. This lack of accountability and deterrence for Palestinians who attack Israelis violates *inter alia* ICERD Article 5(b) and sends a clear message that such attacks are acceptable, and that Israelis should have no expectation of safety in Palestinian-controlled areas.

B. Palestinian Authority denies Jews the right to own property

Another right which the PA is supposed to guarantee under international treaties to which it is a State party, including ICERD Article 5 and ICCPR Article 12 is the right to own property. However, as noted throughout this report, the PA infringes this right for Jews.

C. Palestinian racism against Afro-Palestinians

It is not just Jews who are absent from the West Bank and Gaza. In fact, there are almost no minorities in these territories at all. According to the report submitted by the PA for its first compliance review by the Committee on Elimination of Racial Discrimination in 2019, minorities comprise less than 1% of the Palestinian population in the West Bank and Gaza and they are all e experiencing population declines. This suggests that racism is highly prevalent among Palestinian society. A 2021 study ranks Palestine as the 7th most racist country in the

¹²⁸ Police rescue Czech tourists who accidentally entered Palestinian village, TIMES OF ISRAEL (January 9, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/police-rescue-czech-tourists-who-accidentally-entered-palestinian-village/.

¹²⁹ Judah Ari Gross, *Israeli activists evacuated from Ramallah after car is set on fire*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (June 30, 2016), https://www.timesofisrael.com/israeli-activists-evacuated-from-ramallah-after-car-is-set-on-fire/.

¹³⁰ Gili Cohen, *Two Israeli Journalists Attacked in West Bank Clashes*, HAARETZ (May 16, 2014), https://www.haaretz.com/2-israeli-journalists-attacked-in-west-bank-1.5248566.

¹³¹ Omri Ephraim, *Lynch survivor: I saw murder in their eyes*, YNET (June 27, 2011), https://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4087606,00.html.

¹³² Initial and second periodic reports submitted by the State of Palestine under article 9 of the Convention, due in 2017, UN Doc. CERD/C/PSE/1-2, ¶ 25 (March 21, 2018).

world. Palestine was second, just behind Libya, in the percentage of people who do not want neighbors of another race. 133

Strikingly, there is no significant black-African population. The very small black-Palestinian minority suffers from routine racism. In 2017, Mohammad Obaid, a black folklore dancer from Gaza said that racism makes life more difficult for black Palestinians who are not considered for certain jobs, subjected to harsh treatment by security forces, and are generally rejected for marriage to non-black Palestinians. Ahmed Palestinians refer to them using derogatory terms like abeed (Arabic for slave). Ahmed Saleh, a black singer from Gaza, commented in 2019 and deeply offended by society's racist view. Racism is highly manifested when I sing at concerts. I get referred to by discriminatory terms such as 'chocolate,' 'slave' and others, which are hurtful insults. He added that he is bullied on the streets where white Palestinians try to avoid him, a practice Saleh described as "widespread." 137

D. Palestinian Violations of Freedom of Religion

Palestinian law does not guarantee freedom of thought, conscience or religion. Article 4 of the Palestinian Basic Law states that "Islam is the official religion in Palestine." While it adds that respect for other religions will be maintained, it also states that "the principles of Islamic Sharia shall be a principle source of legislation." As scholars have noted, subordination of legislation to Islamic Sharia law means that Sharia supersedes traditional western human rights even if such rights are technically guaranteed in law. ¹³⁸ Furthermore, Article 18 of the Basic Law states that freedom of religion is guaranteed only if "public order and morals are not violated"—a vague and limiting phrase. ¹³⁹

1. Palestinian violations against Jews

The Oslo Accords lists twelve Jewish religious sites in the West Bank and Gaza Strip which are supposed to be protected by the PA, including by ensuring free access and freedom of worship. However, the PA fails to protect these religious sites or to ensure free access and

¹³³ *Most racist countries* 2021, WORLD POPULATION REVIEW (last visited January 26, 2021), https://worldpopulationreview.com/country-rankings/most-racist-countries.

Ahmed Alnaouq, *Black Palestinians face subtle racism in Gaza*, GULF NEWS (May 5, 2017), https://gulfnews.com/world/mena/black-palestinians-face-subtle-racism-in-gaza-1.2018514.

¹³⁵ Isma'il Kushkush, 'Afro-Palestinians' forge a unique identity in Israel, AP (January 12, 2017), https://apnews.com/article/f6bf554b21d04b56be9d6385fbf36d31.

¹³⁶ Taghreed Ali, *Black Gaza artists fight racism with music*, AL-MONITOR (December 20, 2021), https://www.al-monitor.com/originals/2021/12/black-gaza-artists-fight-racism-music.

¹³⁷ *Id*.

¹³⁸ Majid Rafizadeh, *Christians Sentenced to Death Under Sharia Law*, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (October 14, 2018), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/13122/christians-death-sharia; Antonio Gutierrez, *Compatibility of Sharia law with the European Convention on Human Rights*, Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly (2018) (last visited July 4, 2019) https://website-pace.net/documents/19838/4246196/20181214-PRESSSHARIA-EN.pdf/c3faf77a-c8c7-448d-ac91-a79db1cf4822.

¹³⁹ Articles 4, 18, 2003 Amended Basic Law (last visited July 3, 2019), https://www.palestinianbasiclaw.org/basic-law/2003-amended-basic-law.

¹⁴⁰ The Israeli-Palestinian Interim Agreement – Annex III, Schedule 4 (September 28, 1995), https://mfa.gov.il/mfa/foreignpolicy/peace/guide/pages/the%20israeli-palestinian%20interim%20agreement%20-%20annex%20iii.aspx.

freedom of worship for Jews at the sites. Thus, the PA infringes on the rights of Jews to freedom of religion in violation of the relevant provisions of ICERD, ICCPR and CRC.

As outlined above, a key aspect of the Palestinian narrative reflected in the laws, policies and statements of the PA and Hamas, is the absolute rejection of any Jewish historical claim to Israel or the Palestinian territories. Judaism's holiest sites, including the Western Wall, the Cave of the Patriarchs, Rachel's Tomb, and many other sites are located in territory that was controlled by Jordan from 1948 to 1967 and is now part of the West Bank or East Jerusalem. During that time, Jews were denied access to these sites. Moreover, under Jordan's rule, synagogues in the Jewish Quarter of the Old City were destroyed or desecrated and the Jewish cemetery on the Mount of Olives was desecrated. July Jewish access to these sites was restored only after Israel gained control of the area in 1967.

Unfortunately, after the PA took control of Areas A and B of the West Bank pursuant to the Oslo Accords, Jewish access to many of these sites again became restricted. In general, Palestinian officials have made clear their position that Jews have no rights in such historically Jewish religious sites as the Western Wall or the Cave of the Patriarchs, claiming them as Islamic sites. The Palestinians also have misused international bodies like UNESCO to impose a politicized agenda which denies Jewish historical rights to these holy sites, and falsely accuses Israel of endangering those sites. In fact, it is the Palestinians who, for example, have been endangering the Temple Mount by illegally removing archaeologically-rich earth from the area.

Against this background, it is not surprising that the PA fails to protect Jewish holy sites and ensure the safety of Jewish worshippers at these sites in the territory under its control. Below are some examples:

• **Joseph's Tomb** – Located in the heart of the PA-controlled city of Nablus, Joseph's Tomb is a popular pilgrimage site for Jews. However, due to its location, Jews cannot freely and securely worship there. Under the Oslo Accords, the site was to remain under Israeli control, but the Israeli army withdrew in October 2000 after the site was burnt down by Palestinians. Now monthly Jewish visits must be coordinated and pre-authorized. The

¹⁴¹ Mitchell Bard, Will Palestinians Protect Freedom of Religion and Holy Places in Jerusalem? ALGEMEINER (January 10, 2018), https://www.algemeiner.com/2018/01/10/will-palestinians-protect-freedom-of-religion-and-holy-places-in-jerusalem/.

¹⁴² Id.; Fatah and PA officials: Cave of the Patriarchs "is a purely Islamic mosque where the Jews have now right," PMW (August 9, 2018), https://www.palwatch.org/main.aspx?fi=1100&doc_id=26303.

¹⁴³ 5 Reasons Why Israel & U.S. Pulled Out of UNESCO, UN WATCH (December 23, 2017), https://unwatch.org/israel-pulls-unesco/; PLO outraged as UNESCO chief Irina Bokova slams own agency's Arab-drafted resolution on Jerusalem, UN WATCH (October 17, 2016), https://unwatch.org/plo-outraged-unesco-chief-irina-bokova-slams-agencys-arab-drafted-resolution-jerusalem/

¹⁴⁴ Amanda Borschel-Dan, *Muslim cleanup project 'illegally disturbed, removed' ancient soil on Temple Mt.*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (June 22, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/muslim-cleanup-project-illegally-disturbed-removed-ancient-soil-on-temple-mt/; Daniel K. Eisenbud, *Disproving 'Temple Mount Denial' One Bucket at a Time*, JERUSALEM POST (October 6, 2017), https://www.jpost.com/Magazine/Disproving-Temple-Mount-denial-one-bucket-at-a-time-506539.

¹⁴⁵ Marcy Oster, 2 Palestinians killed in Nablus after throwing explosives at soldiers guarding worshippers at Joseph's Tomb, JTA (March 20, 2019), https://www.jta.org/quick-reads/2-palestinians-killed-in-nablus-after-throwing-explosives-at-soldiers-guarding-worshippers-at-josephs-tomb.

visits take place at night, under heavy guard by the Israeli army and are routinely attacked by Palestinian rock throwers or worse. ¹⁴⁶ In October 2015, at the height of a renewed wave of Palestinian terrorism, Palestinian rioters set fire to the Tomb. ¹⁴⁷ Although Abbas condemned that attack, he himself had incited Palestinian violence with accusations that Israel was trying to take over the Temple Mount. ¹⁴⁸ In November 2018, Palestinians threw firebombs and shot at the Israeli soldiers escorting the pilgrims and two explosive devices were found at the Tomb. ¹⁴⁹ As recently as September 2021, Palestinians attacked the monthly pilgrimage with live fire, stones and explosives. ¹⁵⁰

- Joshua's Tomb As with Joseph's Tomb, Jewish pilgrimages to Joshua's Tomb, located in the Palestinian village of Kifl Haris, are conducted under heavy guard by the Israeli army in the middle of the night due to security concerns. ¹⁵¹ These visits have been attacked by Palestinian rioters. ¹⁵² In February 2018, the site was defaced with swastikas and graffiti. ¹⁵³
- Burial site of Itamar and Elazar Another Jewish holy site in an area controlled by the PA is the burial site of Aaron's sons, Itamar and Elazar, in the Palestinian village of Awarta. As with the other sites, Jewish visits are restricted and occur only on specific days under IDF protection. These visits have been subject to attacks and the site itself has been desecrated.¹⁵⁴
 - 2. Palestinian failure to ensure freedom of religion for Christians

The PA and Hamas also fail to guarantee freedom of religion for Christians. The Christian population in the West Bank and Gaza has rapidly declined over the years, while the Christian population in Israel remains steady. Although Christians comprised 5% of the West Bank in the 1970s, they are now just 2% of the population. In the traditionally Christian cities of

¹⁴⁶ Jacob Magid, *Activists' given special entry to Joseph's Tomb*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (May 11, 2017), https://www.timesofisrael.com/activists-given-special-entry-to-josephs-tomb/.

¹⁴⁷ Palestinian rioters torch Jewish holy site Joseph's Tomb, BBC (October 16, 2015), https://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-34547523.

¹⁴⁸ Joseph's Tomb set ablaze by Palestinian rioters, JERUSALEM POST (October 16, 2015), https://www.jpost.com/Arab-Israeli-Conflict/Josefs-Tomb-set-ablaze-by-Palestinian-rioters-426143; Ari Rabinovitch, Palestinians set fire to Jewish shrine; Israeli soldier stabbed, REUTERS (October 16, 2015), https://www.reuters.com/article/us-israel-palestinians/palestinians-set-fire-to-jewish-shrine-israeli-soldier-stabbed-idUSKCN0SA0GY20151016.

¹⁴⁹ Palestinians shoot at Israeli troops escorting Jews to Joseph's Tomb in West Bank, JTA (November 7, 2018), https://www.jta.org/2018/11/07/israel/palestinians-israeli-troops-clash-jewish-pilgrimage-josephs-tomb-nablus.

¹⁵⁰ Two Israeli soldiers lightly hurt in clashes near West Bank shrine, TIMES OF ISRAEL (September 27, 2021), https://www.timesofisrael.com/two-soldiers-said-lightly-hurt-in-clashes-near-west-bank-shrine/.

Tovah Lazaroff, *In pictures: thousands hike at midnight to visit Joshua's grave*, JERUSALEM POST (May 4, 2016), https://www.jpost.com/Israel-News/Thousands-hike-at-midnight-to-visit-Joshuas-grave-453057.

¹⁵² Firebombs on Joshua's Tomb, ISRAEL NATIONAL NEWS (December 28, 2017), http://www.israelnationalnews.com/News/News.aspx/239925

¹⁵³ Jacob Magid, *Jewish worshippers find swastikas defacing holy site in Palestinian village*, TIMES OF ISRAEL (February 22, 2018), https://www.timesofisrael.com/jewish-worshipers-find-swastikas-defacing-holy-site-in-palestinian-village/.

¹⁵⁴ Ron Ben-Tovim, *Beyond Temple Mount: A Look at Contested Holy Sites in the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, HA'ARETZ (October 22, 2015), https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/.premium-a-look-at-contested-holy-sites-in-the-conflict-1.5412383?=&ts=_1561532376453.

Bethlehem, Beit Sahour and Beit Jala, the Christian population dropped from 86% in 1950 to 12% in 2016, according to Bethlehem's Christian mayor Vera Baboun. 155 In Gaza, the Christian population has dwindled from 5,000 in the year before Hamas took control of the Strip to 1,100 today. 156 This matches similar trends in other parts of the Middle East where Christians are being targeted by Muslim extremists (e.g., in Egypt, Iran, Iraq, Pakistan and Syria).

In this respect, the Christians living in the West Bank and Gaza are no different from their brethren across the Middle East, as they too suffer routine persecution and discrimination at the hands of radical Muslims, including physical attacks, attacks on property, pressure to convert to Islam, theft of land, and other forms of intimidation and harassment. Furthermore, a Muslim who wishes to convert to Christianity in the West Bank or Gaza may face discrimination from both Muslims and Christians, may be rejected by his/her family or forcibly confined to his/her home, and in extreme cases may even be killed. 157

In the first half of 2019 alone, there were at least three grave attacks on Christians in the West Bank. On April 25, 2019, the Christian village of Jifna near Ramallah was attacked by Muslim gunmen who caused severe property damage and terrorized the residents. During the attack, the PA failed to protect the Christian community and it did not arrested any suspects. On May 13, 2019, vandals desecrated a Maronite church in Bethlehem, which had been the subject of numerous previous attacks including a 2015 arson attack following which the church was closed for over two years. On May 16, 2019, an Anglican church near Ramallah was attacked and desecrated. 158

Regrettably, such attacks are not a new phenomenon. Many other similar attacks which were likewise ignored by the relevant governing authorities have been documented over the years in both the West Bank and Gaza. 159 For example, in 2016, Hamas in Gaza bulldozed the archaeological remnant of a Byzantine-era church. The same year, the PA police arrested a prominent Christian merchant from Bethlehem allegedly for threatening another merchant, a charge vehemently denied by the Christian merchant. 160 In addition to these violations, Christians complain of land theft by a Muslim "mafia," and there have been cases of Christians being kidnapped by militants and forcibly converted to Islam. ¹⁶¹ Sadly, this has led to a situation

¹⁵⁵ Melanie Lidman, Christians worry 'Silent Night' may soon refer to their community in Bethlehem, TIMES OF ISRAEL (Dec. 24, 2016), https://www.timesofisrael.com/christians-worry-silent-night-may-soon-refer-to-theircommunity-in-bethlehem/.

¹⁵⁶ *Id*.

¹⁵⁷ Duane Alexander Miller, Freedom of Religion in Israel-Palestine: May Muslims Become Christians, and do Christians have the Freedom to Welcome Such Converts? St. Francis Magazine (Vol. 10, No. 1, April 2014), pp. 19-21.

¹⁵⁸ Dr. Edy Cohen, The Persecution of Christians in the Palestinian Authority, THE BEGIN-SADAT CENTER FOR STRATEGIC STUDIES (May 27, 2019), https://besacenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/1184-The-Persecution-of-Christians-by-the-PA-Cohen-English-final.pdf.

¹⁵⁹ Justus Reid Weiner, Middle Eastern Christians Battered, Violated, and Abused, Do They Have Any Chance of Survival? JERUSALEM CENTER FOR PUBLIC AFFAIRS (2014), http://jcpa.org/text/book.pdf; Khaled Abu Toameh, Palestinians: Erasing Christian History, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (April 12, 2016), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/7832/palestinians-christian-history.

¹⁶⁰ Khaled Abu Toameh, *Palestinians: Erasing Christian History*, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (April 12, 2016), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/7832/palestinians-christian-history.

¹⁶¹ Justus Reid Weiner, supra note 159 p. 20; see also Rami Dabbas, 'Not suitable for living': Gaza's Christian population dwindles amid Hamas rule, job struggles, THE CHRISTIAN POST (May 21, 2021), https://www.christianpost.com/news/gazas-christian-population-dwindles-amid-hamas-rule.html; Nidal al-

where Palestinian Christians feel intimidated, refrain from wearing crosses and carrying Bibles in public, and fear performing conversions on Muslims who wish to change faiths. 162

Although many Palestinian Christians prefer to downplay the problem and even laud their relationship with their majority Muslim neighbors as a model of peaceful coexistence, some admit—though mostly in private—that they suffer violence at the hands of Palestinian Muslims as well as discrimination in hiring, housing and education. 163 As one Palestinian Christian said in 2013, "We are harassed, but you wouldn't know the truth. No one says anything publicly about the Muslims. This is why Christians are running away."164

One Palestinian Christian leader that does speak publicly on the issue, Samir Qumsieh, explained in 2013 that Palestinian Christian leaders such as the mayor of Bethlehem must be diplomatic and cannot afford to publicly criticize Muslims but added that "if somebody claims there is no discrimination, he is a liar." ¹⁶⁵ Qumsieh has been physically attacked for being so outspoken and regularly receives death threats. More recently, Qumsieh said that his cousin had received threats for publishing a Facebook post (later deleted) criticizing a Friday Muslim sermon that had threatened Christians. 166

3. Palestinian persecution of Samaritans

As with Christians, the Samaritan community also suffers PA discrimination and harassment, although to a lesser extent. This community consists of approximately 800 individuals, half of whom reside on Mount Gerizim, overlooking the Palestinian city of Nablus, an area controlled by the PA. This is an ancient community whose roots in the city of Nablus date back to Biblical times. Although they speak Arabic and they live, work and attend school with the Muslim Arabs of Nablus, their faith is closer to Judaism. ¹⁶⁷ The Samaritans consider themselves to be Israelites—descendants of the twelve tribes—and they follow the five books of Moses, speak ancient Hebrew, and observe the Sabbath on Saturday.

About sixty years ago, the Palestinians began refusing to sell the Samaritans land to expand their homes, forcing them out of the ancient quarter of Nablus. In the late 1980s, to escape the violence of the First Intifada, they moved out of Nablus completely to their current neighborhood on top of Mount Gerizim. 168 From 1996 to 2004, the Samaritans had a seat in the

¹⁶⁵ *Id.* pp.20-21.

Mughrabi, Gaza Christians sense pressure to convert to Islam, Reuters (July 6, 2012), https://www.reuters.com/article/us-palestinians-christians-conversion/gaza-christians-sense-pressure-to-convert-toislam-idUSBRE86P0J420120726.

¹⁶² Justus Reid Weiner, supra note 159 p. 19; Miller, supra note 157, p. 19.

¹⁶³ Id.; Robert Nicholson, Why are Palestinian Christians Fleeing? PROVIDENCE JOURNAL (March 1, 2016), https://providencemag.com/2016/03/why-are-palestinian-christians-fleeing/.

¹⁶⁴ Justus Reid Weiner, supra note 159, p. 20.

¹⁶⁶ Khaled Abu Toameh, Palestinians: *The Nightmare of Christians*, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (Dec. 24, 2016), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/9634/palestinian-christians.

¹⁶⁷ Zaini Abdullah, The other "People of Israel," QANTARA (May 15, 2015), https://en.gantara.de/content/samaritans-in-nablus-the-other-people-of-israel

¹⁶⁸ Matt Beynon Rees, *The Samaritan's Secret: Part 2*, AGENCE FRANCE-PRESSE (Feb. 18, 2009), https://www.pri.org/stories/2009-02-18/samaritans-secret-part-2.

Palestinian parliament. However, they have had no representation in parliament since 2004 due to a new law which canceled their seat. 169

Although Samaritans present themselves as a bridge between Jews and Arabs, most Samaritans who participate in Arab life in Nablus refrain from revealing their true identity to strangers. Furthermore, although half of the Samaritans live in the Israeli town of Holon and participate fully in Israeli society, including the Israeli army, the Samaritans in the West Bank report that they hesitate to join the Israeli army out of concerns for the safety of their community from their Muslim Arab neighbors in Nablus. Indeed, Yasser Arafat considered the Samaritans to be "occupied just like us" precisely because they "are not in the army." 171

CONCLUSION

Palestinian apartheid described above has to date enjoyed complete impunity at the United Nations. This must end.

This submission provides evidence of gross and systematic violations by the PA and Hamas of several international treaties to which the State of Palestine is a party. The pervasive antisemitic and terrorist incitement by Palestinian officials, Palestinian media and in Palestinian education must end. Any society exposed to the levels of hatred and violence present in the territories ruled by the PA and Hamas cannot be expected to seek peace. The only way future generations of Palestinians will be able to pursue peace with Israel is if they are educated with messages of peace and tolerance rather than hatred. We urge the COI to address these important issues.

¹⁶⁹ Khaled Abu Toameh, *Palestinians: Insulting Religious Minorities*, GATESTONE INSTITUTE (April 26, 2016), https://www.gatestoneinstitute.org/7924/palestinians-samaritans.

¹⁷⁰ David Lerner and Esra Whitehouse, *Not Muslim, Not Jewish: Ancient Community in the West Bank Feels Increasingly Israeli*, HAARETZ (May 10, 2018), https://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/.premium.MAGAZINE-for-ancient-samaritan-community-a-new-test-of-loyalty-1.6075509?=&ts=1561364333289

¹⁷¹ *Id.*